Education and Anti-corruption: A Case Study

April 2017

Project Report
Acknowledgements

This report was made possible through part funding from the European Union Delegation – Afghanistan and APPRO’s in-kind contribution. APPRO wishes to express its sincere thanks to all those who agreed to participate in this research.

About the Researchers

Peter Reynolds and Barbie Reynolds carried out the research and the writing of this paper.

About Citizens’ Forum Against Corruption (CFAC)

Citizens’ Forum Against Corruption (CFAC) was established in late 2015 to build on the momentum to fight corruption in Afghanistan through a civil society driven initiative. CFAC act as a forum through which civil society organizations, businesses, international donors, and ordinary citizens could protect themselves on legal grounds against extortion by corrupt officials and demand legislative reform and other actions to curb corruption. To this end, CFAC has a mandate to:

- Identify the capacity needs of NGOs, private sector entities, and local and national authorities in conduct of good governance practices with a focus on anti-corruption, knowledge of the policy process, and legal literacy and awareness raising on the utilization of the existing legislation against corruption.
- Strengthen civil society’s oversight of policy processes and government reforms on anti-corruption with a focus at the local level through needs-based capacity building interventions.
- Strengthen accountability, transparency, and thus legitimacy of local and national authorities through informed, pragmatic and constructive advocacy messaging by civil society (including the private sector) on anti-corruption, and adequate and accountable response to these messages from governmental authorities.

Activities of CFAC are conducted through the Anti-corruption Sub-committee of the National Advocacy Committee for Public Policy (NAC-PP). For more information on CFAC and NAC-PP, see: [www.nac-pp.net](http://www.nac-pp.net)

About APPRO

Afghanistan Public Policy Research Organization (APPRO) is an independent social research organization with a mandate to promote social and policy learning to benefit development and reconstruction efforts in Afghanistan and other less developed countries through conducting social scientific research and monitoring, evaluations, and training and mentoring. APPRO is registered with the Ministry of Economy in Afghanistan as a non-profit non-government organization and headquartered in Kabul, Afghanistan with offices in Mazar-e Sharif (north), Herat (west), Kandahar (south), Jalalabad (east), and Bamyan (center). APPRO is the founding member of APPRO-Europe, registered in Belgium.

For more information on APPRO, see: [www.appro.org.af](http://www.appro.org.af)
For more information on APPRO-Europe, see: [www.appro-europe.net](http://www.appro-europe.net)
For more information on NAC-PP, see: [www.nac-pp.net](http://www.nac-pp.net)
Contact: mail@appro.org.af

Photo: [https://prezi.com/xmwjzsrrz1kx/education-in-afghanistan/](https://prezi.com/xmwjzsrrz1kx/education-in-afghanistan/)

APPRO takes full responsibility for all omissions and errors.

© 2017. Afghanistan Public Policy Research Organization. Some rights reserved. This publication may be stored in a retrieval system or transmitted only for non-commercial purposes and with written credit to APPRO and the authors and links to APPRO’s website at [www.appro.org.af](http://www.appro.org.af). Any other use of this publication requires prior written permission, which may be obtained by writing to: mail@appro.org.af
Table of Contents

Introduction ................................................................................................................................. 4
Objectives and Methodology ........................................................................................................ 4
Anti-corruption Education Internationally .................................................................................... 5
  Austria .......................................................................................................................................... 6
  Macedonia ................................................................................................................................. 6
  Indonesia ..................................................................................................................................... 7
    Malang, East Java .................................................................................................................... 7
    Indonesian Islamic Boarding Schools ..................................................................................... 7
  Lithuania ....................................................................................................................................... 7
National Educational Curriculum And Corruption .................................................................. 8
Findings From Empirical Data .................................................................................................... 10
  Educationists ............................................................................................................................. 10
  Religious Leaders ...................................................................................................................... 12
  Head Teachers ............................................................................................................................ 13
  Parents .......................................................................................................................................... 14
  Students and Youth ..................................................................................................................... 15
  Children ....................................................................................................................................... 15
Conclusion and Recommendations .............................................................................................. 16
Introduction

Afghanistan continues to be ranked as one of the top ten most corrupt countries in the world.\(^1\) Methods to fight corruption are increasingly being considered in development and capacity building programming in Afghanistan and other contexts. However, to date there have been very few attempts to integrate anti-corruption in education curricula, particularly in early and mid-level education. Anti-corruption values and attitudes introduced at an early age are likely to pay dividends in the long run with the emergence of a new generation of anti-corruption citizens who stand against corrupt social behavior based on a new set of values and principles. Indeed, this argument has been put forth by the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) and taken up through the Anti-Corruption Academic Initiative (ACAD), launched in May 2011 by UNODC in Boston with the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD), Northeastern University in Boston, and the International Bar Association.

According to UNODC, ACAD is a collaborative academic project which aims to produce a comprehensive anti-corruption academic support tool composed of a menu of academic modules, syllabi, case studies, educational tools and reference materials that may be integrated by universities and other academic institutions into their existing academic programs. As such, ACAD seeks to encourage the teaching of anti-corruption issues as part of courses such as law, business, criminology and political science and thereby address the present lack of inter-disciplinary anti-corruption educational materials suitable for use at both undergraduate and graduate levels. ACAD is expected to result in a detailed bibliography of suggested readings on anti-corruption and a teacher’s manual, in multiple languages and adaptable to multiple legal systems, to aid teachers and instructors in the classroom.\(^2\)

This paper examines the possibilities for incorporating anti-corruption in educational curricula in Afghanistan, based on the assumption that there is a direct link between substantive provisions on anti-corruption in educational curricula and anti-corruption awareness and practice becoming norms in Afghanistan’s social consciousness and culture. The paper further assumes that fostering an interest in civic matters lays the foundation for a future community that has the moral principles and the will to speak out against, and to condemn, corruption in all its forms and to demand accountability from government, private business, and society at large on the virtues of being against corruption.

Objectives and Methodology

This research sought to establish how traditional and religious values could be utilized to fight corruption in Afghanistan through changes to the education system. This paper examines the extent to which traditional and religious values against corruption are being introduced to bring anti-corruption awareness into Afghanistan’s education system with a focus on the national primary, secondary and higher education curricula. The paper also enquires whether anti-corruption features in the teachings of the religious institutions.

\(^1\) Transparency International Corruption Perceptions Index 2016 – www.transparency.org
\(^2\) For more information on ACAD, see: http://www.track.unodc.org/Academia/Pages/ACADOverview.aspx
The following objectives were set for this research:

- Identify provisions on anti-corruption in educational curricula at different levels of education in Afghanistan
- Synthesize best practices in anti-corruption initiatives in educational curricula from other contexts and other conflict environments
- Generate concrete recommendations on changes to curricula at all levels in Afghanistan as a means to institutionalize anti-corruption values and behaviour in Afghanistan.

To following methods were used to meet the above objectives:

- A review and synthesis of the literature on best practices in anti-corruption curricula based on the available information on other countries
- A review of educational curricula at all levels in Afghanistan to establish the provisions on anti-corruption
- Interviews with Key Informants from the Ministry of Education (MoEd), Ministry of Higher Education (MoHE), Ministry of Labor, Social Affairs, Martyrs and the Disabled (MoLSAMD), Ministry of Hajj and Religious Affairs (MoHRA), non-government educational entities and madrassas to establish awareness within these key ministries on the links between teaching and anti-corruption and the readiness to incorporate anti-corruption values in education at all levels.

This report is organized as follows. The next section provides an overview of best practices internationally on fighting corruption through changes to educational curricula. This overview is followed by a synthesis of legal and institutional provisions of the education system in Afghanistan and the actual or potential linkages to anti-corruption needs. The findings from the analysis of the interview data are then presented followed by a conclusion and recommendations.

**Anti-corruption Education Internationally**

Although not specifically addressing anti-corruption programmes in the education system, Transparency International Australia (TIA) have provided some helpful indicators of what works and why. Of particular note is their finding that, across all their case studies, what they identify as ‘internal factors’ are stronger determinants of success than what they term ‘external factors’. Internal factors refer to the dynamics and the quality of the people engaged in delivery of the program while external factors refer to the policies and structures governing the program. Internal factors used by TIA to describe the strongest determinants of success of any program are the energy, enthusiasm and skill of the individual people employed and engaged in actually implementing the program. Although external conditions were found to be important, they appear to have less of an impact on the success of programs than the internal factors.

One internal factor essential to the success of any program is defining a focus and a strategy for that program, accompanied with an action-oriented approach. For example, an antidote to a possible lack of

---

3 *What Works and Why In Community-based Anti-corruption Programs* – Transparency International Australia – December 2006
4 *Ibid.*, pp. 5-6, 8, 35-36 and 39
political will is where there is an increase in the level of ‘noise’ in the public domain. Noise in this context means evident and tangible energy being harnessed in the community – and, perhaps, being picked up by the media. This noise is a manifestation of agents of the much needed change that is not forthcoming from the statutory bodies but that emerges from less institutionalised structures.

The remainder of this section provides a summary of efforts by selected countries in tackling corruption through changes in educational curricula.

**Austria**

The Austrian school system sets out “to train the youth in independent judgment and social understanding.” The Austrian government sees education for corruption prevention and awareness-raising amongst the youth as an important part in the fight against corruption.

The government set up a pilot project in the summer of 2012 for 14-18 year-olds in one secondary school. A project team of experts in psychology, sociology, law, criminology, investigation, education (teachers in secondary education) and political education was established. Students were familiarized with terms such as ‘corruption’, ‘prevention of corruption’, ‘economic crime’ and legal bases of the fight against corruption. Secondly, they were to consider values, decisions and actions, relating these to economic activity and morality in citizenship and to the fight against corruption. The number and length of sessions, as well as detail of the methodology used (role plays exemplifying various contexts, exercises, reflection and discussion) are detailed in their report.  

**Macedonia**

A study by the State Commission for Prevention of Corruption in the Republic of Macedonia looked at ‘Fighting Corruption Through Education’. A paper on this was presented by Vladimir Georgiev at a Conference of the United Nations Convention Against Corruption in Panama in November 2013. This program was directed toward primary school children in 4 schools in 3 cities. The goal was long term impact on corruption. The program involved teaching, interactive workshops, questionnaires and awards. The success of the program was measured through pre- and post-test questionnaires which showed a very significant increase in awareness. A full report of this pilot program was submitted to the Macedonian Ministry of Education and Science in September 2013. The Ministry approved the continuation of the anti-corruption education as an extra-curricular activity in all primary schools throughout the country.

---

6 *Education on (Anti-)Corruption for High School Students* – Republic of Austria Federal Bureau of Anti-corruption within the Ministry of Interior reported in Journal of Education and Practice – [www.iiste.org](http://www.iiste.org) - ISSN 2222-1735 (Paper) ISSN 2222-288X  
9 *Ibid.* Most striking was a 59% increase in children who said they would know how to recognize and how to protect themselves from corruption.
Indonesia

All indications are that Indonesia’s government policy has been strongly against corruption and that there has been some success in introducing anti-corruption awareness and mindset into the education system. Indonesia is predominantly Islamic and, therefore, of particular interest when considering the strongly Islamic historical mindset of Afghanistan.

Malang, East Java

A thorough research project working with 30 primary school teachers in training at the University of Kanjuruhan in Malang, East Java [Indonesia] – predominantly Muslim – looks in depth at the components of an effective program of anti-corruption education in schools. It deals with the underlying success factors rather than a simple, superficial [on paper] curriculum development.

The key to the success of character education is identified as the Principal. If the Principal has the intention to change to be better, then the Principal will pass on good behavior to teachers and students. A related success factor is cooperation throughout the entire school community including principals, teachers, students, and education staff who, together, constitute a meeting point between theory and practice of anti-corruption. The outcome should be a change in the daily attitude of teachers against corruption in performing their duties and strict punishment to teachers and education department officials who commit acts of corruption.10

Indonesian Islamic Boarding Schools

Of further possible relevance to Afghanistan is a campaign against corruption based in the religious communities of Indonesia’s Islamic boarding schools.11 This was a non-government initiative that worked through the guidance of respected religious community figures coupled with the enthusiasm of young students who demanded greater transparency and an end to theft of public funds.

Lithuania

This program was written more than 10 years ago and was not developed in an Islamic culture and society such as Afghanistan. However, it contains a number of relevant elements for Afghanistan. The program outlines a comprehensive list of topics to be tackled for fighting corruption through education. These are:

• The Concept, Consequences and Origin of Corruption
  The Possibilities of Combating Corruption
• The Problems of Combating Corruption
• Personality and Behavior: Personal Values and Principles, Essence and Purpose of Life, Criteria for Distinguishing Good from Evil, Decisions and Choices, Causes and Effects, Responsibility
• Behaviors and Regulating Norms
• Legal and Illegal Behavior
• Relation between Morality and Law

10 The Development of Anti-corruption Education Course for Primary School Teacher Education Students – Ninik Indawati, University of Kanjuruha, Malang, East Java, Indonesia
This model from Lithuania provides useful pointers for developing a program of anti-corruption within Afghanistan’s education system. The model provides detailed structure and multi-level timetable for all different grades from primary to higher education.\textsuperscript{12}

Evaluations of best practice programmes for fighting corruption through raising anti-corruption awareness in the younger generation are still at a very formative stage. Objective measures of effectiveness or impact on curbing corruption in any given society, culture or location necessitate a longer time span to measure effective impact.

Pre- and post-test evaluations are of some use as they are indicative of increased awareness through the program. However, more thorough evaluations are sparse as the programs are relatively new and more longitudinal studies of effectiveness are not available.

**National Educational Curriculum And Corruption**

The vision in the Ministry of Education’s (MoEd) Curriculum Framework is “Cultivation of traditions and religious and moral values. The new curriculum fosters the development of students’ personalities as human beings, good Muslims and true Afghans.” The aim is that: “By the completion of the schooling cycles, when young people enter the world of work, as a result of the implantation of the new curriculum, they will be good Muslims, civilized human beings and true, self-reliant Afghans.”\textsuperscript{13}

While nothing explicitly is stated in the MoEd’s Education Policy, anti-corruption, there are references to guarding against “wrongdoing”:

> Schools should give orientation to students about the negative and destructive consequences of wrongdoing by engaging in terrorism, drug abuse, conflicts and acts of discrimination.\textsuperscript{14}

The absence of direct references to corruption as a wrongdoing suggests that at the time when the policy was being devised corruption was not seen as a significant issue and thus not as a consideration in developing the Curriculum Framework.


\textsuperscript{14} Ibid. Page 17

www.appro.org.af
There are a number of references to incorporating accurate and standardized principles of Islam in educational curricula. The MoEd Curriculum (2011) states the problems, needs, and expectations in this regard as follows:

- **Problems:** Lack of a standardized and unified curriculum for madrassas. It is a long time since the curriculum of madrassas has been revised.
- **Need:** A curriculum that reflects Islamic teachings and the positive culture of Afghanistan.....[and] securing the cooperation of mosque imams in pre-school learning.
- **Expectations:** The promotion of Islamic values, positive human culture and ethical values for students and the promotion of altruism, human rights, Islamic brotherhood, tolerance and peaceful coexistence, moderation, peace and rule of law.\(^{15}\)

The subjects and topics included in the curriculum include the Holy Qur’an, Beliefs, Law and Morals, Hadith and Sunnah. Students study Islam 5-6 hours per week throughout their schooling.

Apart from one lesson in Grade 9, nothing of anti-corruption is explicitly stated in the Islamic teaching textbooks for Grades 1-12.\(^{16}\) The Grade 9 lesson is entitled ‘Prohibition of Bribery’ and explains the holy prophet’s narrative: “the briber and the bribee are both in hell fire”. The lesson denounces bribery as the main cause of financial and administrative corruption. The lesson asks the students to think and talk about what constitutes a gift and what constitutes a bribe, without providing a definitional distinction between the two. The purpose seems to be to reach a consensus on what is acceptable as a gift and when gift becomes a bribe.

Other lessons cover recitation of the holy Qur’an, prayers, stories of the prophets, ethics (parents’ rights, neighbours’ rights, elders’ rights), peace, the hereafter, the lawful and the unlawful, justice, inheritance, and marriage.

Some activities contained in textbooks refer students to Imams of mosques for discussion and to ask questions.\(^{17}\) Also, Islamic teachings in higher education are taught based on chapters provided independently by instructors and have no unified or standardized content. Philosophy and History of Religion, along with Principles of Islam are the dominant subjects in Higher Education.\(^{18}\) The National Curriculum encourages educators to utilize a variety of strategies for fulfilling the educational objectives. For instance, it suggests inviting guest speakers (religious leaders, experienced leaders, scientists, media and parents) to schools to speak on specific issues.

Two other ministries were examined to establish the extent to which anti-corruption was incorporated in training and other vocational activities. These were the Ministry of Labor, Social Affairs, Martyrs and the Disabled (MoLSAMD) and the Ministry of Hajj and Religious Affairs (MoHRA). MoLSAMD confirmed that there were no policy documents dealing with anti-corruption education and training while the key informants from MoHRA reported that the ministry was promoting anti-corruption through mosque sermons, Friday prayers and other religious events.\(^{19}\)

\(^{15}\) MoEd – National Curriculum (2011), pp. 10-20
\(^{16}\) MoEd – National Curriculum (2011) – Islamic Teachings subject – p.86
\(^{17}\) *Ibid.* Islamic Teachings – Grade 3 – p.44
\(^{18}\) MoHE – National Higher Education Strategic Plan: 2010-2014
\(^{19}\) Ki-M-Go-MoHRA-1
Findings From Empirical Data

Educationists

All the educationists, government officials working in the sector, see corruption as wrong. They all define corruption as outside the rules and value framework of Islam, breaching law, and violating regulations and public benefit.\textsuperscript{20} They see corruption not only in financial terms but also in terms of working against the public good by a multiplicity of actors including insurgents, donors, NGOs, and government officials.\textsuperscript{21} Corruption is also seen as a serious threat to stability and peace.\textsuperscript{22}

These government officials see the causes of corruption as both internal and external.\textsuperscript{23} Some complain that the rule of law not being respected by the government itself contributes to corruption. Others are concerned that religious values are being eroded through committing corruption.\textsuperscript{24}

Closely-knit personal relations were pointed to as one of the internal causes of corruption within the Afghan culture. For many of those interviewed, these close relations are stronger than the rule of law or religious beliefs and values.\textsuperscript{25} The remedy for dealing with corruption, however, would need to come from appealing to people’s belief systems and moral values.

The educationists would like to see the religious institutions in Afghanistan as being more vocal on the issue of corruption.\textsuperscript{26} Many individuals immersed in corruption also claim that they are religious and say their prayers on time.\textsuperscript{27}

The education system has failed in instilling ethical, anti-corruption values in people in part due to the fact that there is corruption in the education system itself.\textsuperscript{28} Evidence of corruption in the education system is given as teachers being appointed without going through a proper assessment in the recruitment process and false passing grades and graduation certificates being given to failed students in return for bribes. Moral values are also not adequately taught to students, evidenced, for example, by the sexual harassment of young girls in the schools and in the streets. For example,

\begin{quote}
Violence against women is rife…. violence against women is a form of corruption. Women are violated in the street and everywhere. Values [on respect for women] need to be taught in the curriculum.\textsuperscript{29}
\end{quote}

Some educationists feel strongly that Islam’s emphasis on nurturing children to become good human beings in the future should be more systematically applied in education.\textsuperscript{30} As one interviewee put it, “If

\begin{itemize}
\item Ki-M-Go-Ed-1, Ki-M-Go-HE-1, Ki-M-Go-Ed-2, Ki-M-Go-Ed-3, Ki-M-Go-Ed-4
\item Ki-M-Go-Ed-1, Ki-M-Go-Ed-2
\item Ki-M-Go-HE-2
\item Ki-M-Go-HE-1
\item Ki-F-Go-Ed-1, Ki-M-Go-HE-2
\item Ki-M-Go-HE-2
\item Ki-M-Go-HE-1, Ki-M-Go-Ed-2, Ki-M-Go-Ed-3
\item Ki-M-Go-Ed-1, Ki-M-Go-HE-2
\item Ki-M-Go-Ed-1, Ki-M-Go-Ed-2
\item Ki-M-Go-Ed-1, Ki-M-Go-HE-2
\item Ki-F-Go-Ed-1, Ki-M-Go-HE-2
\item Ki-F-Go-Ed-1, Ki-M-Go-HE-2
\end{itemize}
you as a role model act corrupt, your son becomes corrupt also.\textsuperscript{31} None of the educationists interviewed was happy with the content and teaching methodology of Islamic subjects taught in schools, madrassas or universities. A major problem is that,

\begin{quote}
... those who are supposed to convey the [moral values], the teachers,.....[are] not committed to what they preach and, second, they cannot convey the message [because they are not qualified].\textsuperscript{32}
\end{quote}

Another interviewee observed,

\begin{quote}
The main problem is with [teaching] methodology – teachers teaching Islamic values need to be trained.\textsuperscript{33}
\end{quote}

And that,

\begin{quote}
....there is not a good relationship between those who teach (mainly Mullahs) and the young. We need logic in Islamic teaching, not takfeer (excommunication)...... the level of Islamic thought taught at schools is not suited to young students.\textsuperscript{34}
\end{quote}

Some argued for the need to teach Islamic values to young people in a more appealing manner and that ethical values should be taught “through stories” and “translated into action” on “subjects like ethics at work, Islam and social responsibilities, citizens’ rights and responsibilities, democracy, organisational ethics, etc.”\textsuperscript{35} The systemic problem of the education system, including how it has failed to address the issue of corruption, was summed up by an educationist as follows:

\begin{quote}
We need agreement between policy makers (most of them do not understand the problem), the technical team who develop religious teaching material (mostly Mullahs) and instructors (mostly incompetent). There should be a joint body that establishes the core values and evaluates outcomes of the education.\textsuperscript{36}
\end{quote}

Some of the educationists feel strongly that the media should be used more effectively in mainstreaming anti-corruption. As one key informant put it:

\begin{quote}
The media is “equal to and even more influential than educational institutions in [in bringing corruption to public attentions] with ....[anti-corruption] programs for children.\textsuperscript{37}
\end{quote}

All of the Educationists see corruption as not only wrong but also urgently needing to be addressed as a necessary condition for stability and peace in Afghanistan. They see the problem of corruption as far more dangerous than the terrorism and as a major driver for much of the terrorism. Anti-corruption is not being taught in schools, madrassas or universities.
Religious Leaders

Religious scholars view corruption as much more than bribery. They see it as including “appointing bad people, nepotism, and misusing public assets for private purposes (including the misuse of the facilities of madrassas).” The religious scholars also see the issue of corruption in Afghanistan as being linked to insecurity with insurgency having its roots in corruption. As one religious scholar put it, “corruption is the mother of insecurity and all other evils.”

The main driver for widespread corruption is seen as a general lack of the rule of law where “the rich do whatever they want” and the “majority of civil servants are not observing religious and ethical principles.” Corruption is also linked to a waning in “spirituality” and lack of “belief in Islamic values” of which “the main cause is the weakness of Islamic teaching”.

Most of the religious leaders interviewed claimed that the mosques did refer to the issue of corruption but that such sermons and references “have no executive power”, are “not satisfactory”, “are not effective” and that “ethical principles are limited to the mosque”. Two of the religious scholars interviewed thought that mosques were not sufficiently aware that corruption had become a norm for most people in Afghanistan and that religious institutions did not fully understood the severity of the problem.

The scholars also pointed to a tension and distrust between formal education system and madrassas. Som religious leaders see formal educational institutions in Afghanistan as “centres of corruption”.

Addressing the question whether traditional and religious values can be helpful with regard to anti-corruption, the religious leaders see the problem as being with the Muslim and not with Islam. They point to the direct instructions in the holy Qur’an on not to giving or taking bribes and that the Qur’an has the hardest punishment on earth for those who become involved in corruption. The main problem in teaching against corruption based on Islamic values is that most instructors themselves are ignorant of the provisions of the holy Qur’an on anti-corruption.

All the religious scholars interviewed expressed strong dissatisfaction with the content and teaching methodology of ‘Islamic Teaching’ being taught in schools, madrassas and universities. For example,

We face a paradox: religion is supposed to be the pillar, but rulers and administrators are against it. It’s the case with anti-corruption – even if it is included, it is not taught or it is ignored.

And,
I’m not satisfied with contents or methodology [of teaching Islamic values]. We are losing in both religious and educational institutions. I suggest the MoEd and the MoHE consider good people for developing a curriculum based on the realities and needs of the country. \(^{48}\)

Also,

The teaching methodology is not good and it rarely leads to application of what we have learned.\(^ {49}\)

When asked in what possible ways MoEd, MoHE, and MoHRA could more effectively promote anti-corruption, the responses ranged from insufficient capacity at these ministries to effect reform to corruption being widespread within the ministries themselves.\(^ {50}\) For the reforms to happen and be effective, some felt there was a need for “a joint plan” by multiple government and non-government actors and “a mechanism for establishing trust and cooperation”, using “good and professional people”.\(^ {51}\)

The curriculum should be reformed “for the purpose of creating a culture of integrity” and to “pay attention to ethics and morality because knowledge without ethics has no value”.\(^ {52}\) As with the Government Educationists, all the clerics see the media as a major player with immense potential to fight corruption.

Like the Educationists, the religious scholars see a direct link between corruption and terrorism. The rise in corruption in Afghanistan is due to a waning spirituality and lack of belief in Islamic values, a major cause of which is the weakness of Islamic teaching by unqualified instructors. They see anti-corruption as embedded in all Islamic teachings but, where anti-corruption is taught in the mosques, it is not taught in a way that is of practical use to daily life. All the scholars interviewed expressed strong dissatisfaction with both the content and methodology of teaching Islamic values in schools, madrassas and universities.

**Head Teachers**

The responses of the Head Teachers replicated the responses by the Educationists and the Religious Scholars. All head teachers saw the issue of corruption as very important, “root of all problems, and “the main obstacle for our progress”.\(^ {53}\) The main drivers of corruption are “injustice and wrongdoing of the powerful”, “lack of a sense of responsibility and accountability, lack of rule of law, lack of commitment to duties, lack of control and monitoring” and “war and insecurity, and government’s lack of attention to social issues”.\(^ {54}\)

Two of the head teachers felt strongly that religious authorities could do much more against those who were “justifying corruption.”\(^ {55}\) Asked if their schools teach anti-corruption, one head teacher pointed
out, “we have wall posters on anti-corruption at our school” and “we are trying to promote *halal* earning, respect for society and contentment”.  

All of head teachers see Islamic values as helpful with regard to anti-corruption.

As to whether traditional and religious anti-corruption teachings are being incorporated into the educational curriculum, the head teachers stated that there were references to halal and haram in Islamic studies but that nobody really cared what they meant in practice. Some of the head teachers were unaware that there was a National Curriculum.  

Also, in contrast to the educationists and the religious scholars, the head teachers did not have issues with content and methodology of religious teaching in schools. However, some of the head teachers thought that MoEd, MoHE and MoHRA should cooperate in developing materials for a book on anti-corruption, posters, and other means to raise awareness about corruption and the need to confront it.

As with the educationists and the religious Scholars, the head teachers see the media as a potential force in countering corruption by, for example, by introducing “role models of integrity”. Some, however, are concerned that the media itself is corrupt.

**Parents**

The parents we interviewed seemed less aware of the complexities of corruption described by the educationists, religious scholars, and head teachers. They seemed more conscious only of monetary corruption, in form of paying or receiving bribes, rather than corruption’s subtleties of expression in its various forms. The parents defined corruption in terms of theft, bribery, abduction, and even suicide attack. The parents appear less certain about specific, accurate knowledge of Islamic values against corruption.

All the parents see it as a joint responsibility between parents and the educational institutions to teach children to stand against corruption in Afghanistan. Overwhelmingly, however, they see it primarily as the family’s responsibility. This suggests that the current climate is conducive to school-home partnerships or teacher-parent associations for anti-corruption workshops.

When asked ‘In what way are traditional and Islamic anti-corruption teachings being incorporated into the curriculum of schools, madrassas and universities?’ Most parents did not know. One father said, “nothing has been done yet” while another said that “Islamic teaching is good in schools”. The response by one parent to the question of how MoEd and MoHE could more effectively promote anti-corruption in education was that “the ministries should start from themselves” and that “the ministries should stop

---

56 Ki-M-Ed-HT-2, Ki-F-Ed-HT-3  
57 At a 6-week Teacher Training Programme on Active Participatory Learning Methodology – Kabul, January-March 2017, of 14 primary school teachers, one head teacher had seen the National Curriculum and two head teachers had heard that a National Curriculum existed. None of the remaining 11 teachers had heard of the National Curriculum.  
60 Ki-F-Ed-HT-1  
61 Ki-F-Prnt-1, Ki-M-Prnt-1, Ki-M-Prnt-2, Ki-M-Prnt-4
bribery and theft”. 62 One father said, “the teachers should be evaluated [for their qualification and ability to teach]”. 63

Although similarly full of disdain for corruption, the parents seemed less aware of how corruption was, or was not, being addressed in education. Most of the parents are unaware of the contents of the 2011 National Curriculum.

Students and Youth

All students and youth interviewed saw corruption as an important and urgent issue to be dealt with. The main cause of corruption in Afghanistan was seen as the powerful abusing the poor and vulnerable in a context with a very high rate of illiteracy and a culture of “lawlessness.” A number of the students interviewed made references to Islam’s provisions against corruption, including physical punishment and the responsibility of religious leaders to preach against corruption. 64

All the youth and students interviewed claimed that they had not heard anything about corruption when they went to mosques but were told not to lie, not to steal other people’s property, not to cheat, not to violate others’ rights, and respect elders. None of the students and young people had learned anything about corruption in their education. 65 One stated that he was not satisfied with the methodology in religious instruction because the instructors “just talk.” Another stated that “our teacher only reads from the book; there were no lesson plans and nothing to make the lesson appealing.” 60

Some of those interviewed felt that because there was corruption in MoEd and MoHE, it would unlikely that these ministries would do anything to deal with corruption through changes in the curriculum. 66

Children

Of the children interviewed, none understood the meaning of corruption. 67 They were asked how they would feel if one of the other children in their class hardly did any work but always got top marks because his parents paid the teacher. All felt that they would be angry with one saying that this would not be “a good job”. The children implied that corruption was bad, unjust, and that it should not be done.

Asked what they had learned in school about not being corrupt, the children gave the examples of “not telling lies”, “murder is bad”, “theft is bad” and “a good human being should not do these things.” Asked what they had heard in the mosque about not being corrupt, only one of the children said that he had been to the mosque but that he had heard nothing.

62 Ki-M-Prnt-1, Ki-M-Prnt-3
63 Ki-M-Prnt-2
64 Ki-F-SecSchPupl-1, Ki-M-UniStud-1, Ki-M-UniStud-2
65 Ki-F-SecSchPupl-1, Ki-M-UniStud-1
66 Ki-F-HSchGrad-1, Ki-F-SecSchPupl-1, Ki-M-UniStud-1
67 One girl and 4 boys [8 to 10 year olds] were interviewed.
Conclusion and Recommendations

All respondents in this study believe that Islam is totally against corruption. Islamic values are an obvious starting point for raising awareness against corruption. However, methods of delivering Islamic teaching were strongly and consistently described as unimaginative and ineffective, and done by unqualified instructors who fail to discuss the implications of Islamic provisions against corruption in practical, everyday, terms. The teaching methods were described as uninspiring, unengaging, rote-learned, and disinterested.

With well trained and enthusiastic teachers communicating Islamic teachings that promote integrity and humanity, a wave of resistance to the endemic corruption in Afghan society could be stemmed. The question is how this breed of teachers is to be found, trained and deployed within the education system.

Islamic values are evidently held in high esteem by all those interviewed for this study. Islam denounces injustice, corruption, ethnocentrism, ignorance, poverty, discrimination, nepotism, bribery, deception and misusing public property [bait-ul-mal]. These values need to be incorporated into the education system through changes in the curriculum and appointment of knowledgeable, qualified, and experienced instructors.

The following recommendations may be made on the basis of this study.

• Motivated community leaders need to enlist and engage joint bodies drawn from educationists, religious scholars, teachers, parents, young people, and students along with cooperation from the Media to raise the place of corruption in public awareness.

• Afghanistan needs to see tangible Afghan, home-grown models on the ground of what good practice looks like. Afghanistan needs to see clear examples and working models [within Afghanistan] of effective education and what societal relationships with good practice against corruption look like.

• Civil society and its organizations should take a much more serious interest in placing anti-corruption on the political agenda through, for example, collaboration with media. Similarly, parents and parents associations need to put pressure on the school system, particularly at the primary and secondary levels, for practical instructions against corruption based on Islamic values. Initially, these initiatives may have to find their expression in extra-curricular societies, associations, conferences and other activities.

• The evident loss of confidence and trust in the government indicates that effective moves must be organic [from within the community] rather than mere superficial, window dressing policy changes.

• Extracurricular activities such as anti-corruption school clubs and conferences organized from within the community should be used to arouse interest, create a common voice, and mobilize action.

• Revision of curricula by MoEd and MoHE – possibly, also, involving MoHRA – is essential. Social and work ethics, social and civic responsibility and Islamic values need to be taught at all levels of education. To correct the prevailing culture of corruption, these subjects should need to be taught with a focus on anti-corruption – showing corruption as the pivotal evil and destructive force undermining the well-being and progress of the nation.
APPENDIX A

Islamic Teachings in National Curriculum (1390) [2011] Number of hours allocated according to Grade

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Curriculum Areas and Subject</th>
<th>Upper Secondary Education</th>
<th>Intermediate Education</th>
<th>Basic Education</th>
<th>Primary Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Classes</td>
<td>12 11 10</td>
<td>9 8 7</td>
<td>6 5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islamic Studies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Holy Quran</td>
<td></td>
<td>2 2 2</td>
<td>3 3 3</td>
<td>3 3 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islamic Education - Beliefs, Law, and Morals</td>
<td></td>
<td>3 3 3</td>
<td>3 3 3</td>
<td>3 3 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islamic Education - Hadis, Law, and the way of the Prophets</td>
<td></td>
<td>3 3 3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islamic Education - Belief, Hadis &amp; Law</td>
<td></td>
<td>3 3 3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interpretation of Holy Quran</td>
<td>2 2 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX B: Guiding Questions

Guiding Questions – Parents
1. How would you define corruption? What examples of this do you see in Afghanistan?
2. Can you provide examples of traditional and religious values that can be helpful with regard to anti-corruption? What is your personal experience of this?
3. In your opinion, how much is it the educational institutions’ responsibility and how much is it the family’s responsibility to teach children to stand against corruption in Afghanistan?
4. In what way are traditional and religious anti-corruption teachings being incorporated into the educational curriculum (schools, madrasas, universities)? Give examples.
5. What do you think about the content and teaching methodology of religious education taught in schools, madrasas, universities? How are they being taught? What are your suggestions?
6. Thinking about the MoEd/MoHE what are possible ways they could more effectively promote anti-corruption?
7. What part should the media play to counter corruption? Give examples of how.
8. Any other thoughts you have about how educational institutions can help fight corruption in Afghanistan?

Guiding Questions – Students and Youth
1. How would you define corruption? What examples of this do you see in Afghanistan?
2. In your opinion, how important is the issue of corruption in Afghanistan – and how urgent is it that it should be corrected?
3. Can you provide examples of traditional and religious values that can be helpful with regard to anti-corruption? What is your personal experience of this?
4. What have you learned in the mosque about corruption in Afghanistan?
5. What have you learned at school or university about corruption?
6. What do you think about the content and teaching methodology of religious education taught in schools, madrasas, universities? How are they being taught? What are your suggestions?
7. Thinking about the MoEd/MoHE what are possible ways they could more effectively promote anti-corruption?
8. What part should the media play to counter corruption? Give examples of how.
9. Any other thoughts you have about how educational institutions can help fight corruption in Afghanistan?

Guiding Questions – Children
1. What is corruption?
2. How would you feel if one of the children in your class hardly did any work but always got top marks because his parents paid the teacher?
3. Do you think that corruption is right or not? Why?
4. What do you think could be done about it?
5. What have you learned in school about not being corrupt?
6. What have you learned from your mullah in the mosque about not being corrupt?
7. If you were given Afs 16,700 [$251] what would you do with it?
8. What ways do you think could be used to fight corruption in Afghanistan?
Guiding Questions – All

1. How would you define corruption? What examples of this do you see in Afghanistan?
2. In your opinion, how important is the issue of corruption in Afghanistan – and how urgent is it that it should be corrected?
3. What are the main causes of corruption in Afghanistan? List and Describe
4. Do religious institutions refer to corruption in Afghanistan? If yes, how? Give examples.
5. Do educational institutions refer to corruption in Afghanistan? If yes, how? Give examples.
6. Can you provide examples of traditional and religious values that can be helpful with regard to anti-corruption? What is your personal experience of this?
7. In what way are traditional and religious anti-corruption teachings being incorporated into the educational curriculum (schools, madrasas, universities)? Give examples.
8. What do you think about the content and teaching methodology of religious education taught in schools, madrasas, universities? How are they being taught? What are your suggestions?
9. Thinking about the MoEd/MoHE what are possible ways they could more effectively promote anti-corruption?
10. If there is a chance of reviewing educational curricula, how could ‘anti-corruption’ be included?
11. What part should the media play to counter corruption? Give examples of how.
12. Any other thoughts you have about how educational institutions can help fight corruption in Afghanistan?
**Codes Used for Key Informants**

**Ki-F-Go-Ed-1** (Ki = Key Informant, F = Female, Go = Government, Ed = Educationist, 1 = Sequence)

**Ki-M-Go-HE-1** (Ki = Key Informant, M = Male, Go = Government, HE = Higher Education, 1 + Sequence)

**Ki-F-Go-MoLSAMD-1** (Ki = Key Informant, F = Female, Go = Government, MoLSAMD = Ministry of Labor, Social Affairs, Martyrs and the Disabled)

**Ki-M-Go-MoHRA-1** (Ki = Key Informant, M = Male, Go = Government, MoHRA = Ministry of Hajj and Religious Affairs)

**Ki-M-Ul-Ed-1** (Ki = Key Informant, M = Male, Ul = Ulema, Ed = Educationist, 1 = Sequence)

**Ki-M-Ul-NGO-1** (Ki = Key Informant, M = Male, Ul = Ulema, NGO = Non-government Organization, 1 = Sequence)

**Ki-M-Ed-HT-1** (Ki = Key Informant, M = Male, Ed = Educationist, HT = Head Teacher, 1 = Sequence)

**Ki—F-Prnt-1** (Ki = Key Informant, F = Female, Prnt = Parent, 1 = Sequence)

**Ki-F-HSchGrad-1** (Ki = Key Informant, F = Female, HSchGrad = High School Graduate [recently], 1 = Sequence)

**Ki-F-SecSchPupl-1** (Ki = Key Informant, F = Female, SecSchPupl = Secondary School)

**Ki-Ch-1** (Ki = Key Informant, Ch = Child, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 = all 5)